8.1 - Appendix C

# Cardiff Council Annual Governance Statement 2018/19

Arto

#### CONTENTS

Scope of Responsibility	page	3
Purpose of the Framework	page	3
The Governance Framework	page	4
Assessment Process and Summary	page	4
Assurance Statements	page	5
Senior Management Statement	page	5
Audit Manager Statement	page	6
Audit Committee Statement	page	7
Governance Framework: supporting information	page	9
Annual Governance Statement Action Plan	page	25
Cardiff and the Vale of Glamorgan Pension Fund	page	26
Certification	page	27

#### Scope of Responsibility

- 1. Cardiff Council (the Council) is responsible for ensuring that its business is conducted in accordance with the law and proper standards, and that public money is safeguarded and properly accounted for, having regard to a combination of economy, efficiency and effectiveness. In discharging this overall responsibility, the Council is responsible for putting in place proper arrangements for the governance of its affairs, and facilitating the effective exercise of its functions, including arrangements for the management of risk.
- 2. The Council is responsible for the Cardiff Harbour Authority. The Council is also the Administering Authority for the Cardiff and Vale of Glamorgan Pension Fund (the Pension Fund) and Cardiff Port Health Authority (CPHA), and is the Accountable Body for the Cardiff Capital Region (CCR) City Deal. The governance arrangements detailed in this Annual Governance Statement (AGS) are documented in consideration of the Council's areas of responsibility, and the extent to which the Council is charged with governance.
- 3. The Council has adopted the 'Delivering Good Governance in Local Government' framework, developed by the Chartered Institute of Public Finance and Accountancy (CIPFA) and the Society of Local Authority Chief Executives and Senior Managers (SOLACE). This statement explains how the Council has complied with the Governance Framework and meets the requirements of the Accounts and Audit (Wales) Regulations 2014, as amended by the Accounts and Audit (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2018.
- 4. The governance arrangements in the Council's three wholly owned subsidiary companies which traded in 2018/19, namely Cardiff City Transport Services Ltd. (Cardiff Bus), Cardiff Business Technology Centre (CBTC) and Atebion Solutions are subject to periodic review. These were not reviewed by the Council in 2018/19. The Council also has an interest in a special purpose vehicle (CSC Foundry Limited) which is governed by a Joint Committee for the CCR City Deal.

#### The Purpose of the Governance Framework

- 5. The Governance Framework comprises the systems, processes, culture and values by which the Council is directed, controlled, and the means through which it accounts to, engages with, and leads the community. It enables the Council to monitor the achievement of its strategic objectives and to consider whether those objectives have led to the delivery of appropriate, cost-effective services. The Council's Constitution sets out how decisions are made and the procedures which are followed through rules, codes of practice and protocols.
- 6. The system of internal control is a significant part of the framework and is designed to manage risk to a reasonable level. It cannot eliminate all risk of failure to achieve policies, aims and objectives but is based on an ongoing process to identify, prioritise and appropriately manage risk.

7. The Code of Corporate Governance developed in 2017/18, and reviewed by Audit Committee in January 2018, documents how we apply the principles of good governance (as summarised in Section 4 of the AGS – Assessment Process and Summary). This Code was approved at the Constitution Committee on 11th February 2019 and is included in the Council's Constitution.

#### The Governance Framework

8. The Framework comprises two core principles and five supporting principles. Principles A and B run through principles C to G but good governance is dynamic, and the Council as a whole is committed to improving governance on a continuing basis through a process of evaluation and review.

#### Core principles:

- a. Behaving with integrity, demonstrating strong commitment to ethical values, and respecting the rule of law
- b. Ensuring openness and comprehensive stakeholder engagement Supporting Principles:
- c. Defining outcomes in terms of sustainable economic, social, and environmental benefits
- d. Determining the interventions necessary to optimise the achievement of the intended outcomes
- e. Developing the entity's capacity, including the capability of its leadership and the individuals within it
- f. Managing risks and performance through robust internal control and strong public financial management
- g. Implementing good practices in transparency, reporting, and audit to deliver effective accountability

#### Assessment Process and Summary

- 9. The AGS summarises the assessment of governance against the governance framework and comprises three elements:
  - 1) Statements from Senior Management, the Audit Manager and the Audit Committee
  - 2) Supporting information and evidence mapped to the core and supporting good governance principles
  - 3) A Senior Management review of the Council's significant governance issues
- 10. These three elements when taken together represent the assessment of governance, through the perspectives of the Senior Management Team (SMT) and the independent opinions of the Internal Audit Manager and Audit Committee based on their respective programmes of work and an assessment of the system of internal control.
- 11. For further information and detail, supporting information is mapped to the governance framework principles (a-g) within the AGS, and followed by an open

disclosure from the SMT of the significant governance issues affecting the organisation as summary actions to take forward and address.

12. The diagram in fig. 1 sets out the components of this assessment.





#### i) Assurance Statements

13. The following statements are made at the year-end, upon consideration of the performance information, governance disclosures and audit and regulatory report findings from assessors both internal and external to the Council.

#### **Senior Management Statement**

- 14. As a Senior Management Team we have self-assessed directorate and corporate governance arrangements in place during 2018/19. The assessment was based on the governance maturity which we could evidence within each Directorate against a series of assurance statements. Each Director was responsible for completing a robust assessment of governance within their directorate and identifying and reporting significant governance issues. The Senior Management Team reviewed all returns in May 2019, from which the Chief Executive authorised the overall position.
- 15. The Senior Management Assurance process and engagement within our Directorate Management Teams has led to a more transparent discussion around evidencing our assessments. We can report an overall assessment of approaching 'strong' application of good governance across the assurance areas with some examples of embedded and limited in some assurance areas in some directorates. This assessment was based on a self-assessment using a 5-point rating system ranging from 'not in place', 'limited application', 'mixed

application', 'strong application' to 'embedded'. The Senior Management focus is on ensuring that there is a wider consistency of strong across directorates and the Council which reflects the findings identified through the Senior Management Assurance process and operational reviews.

- 16. The maturity assessment highlighted opportunities to further enhance the disciplines of partnership and collaborative governance and compliance the detail of which is presented in the Annual Governance Statement Action Plan. The Senior Management Team recognises the need to prioritise actions for enhancement to enable strong evidence of application across all areas going forward.
- 17. In relation to the work of the Senior Management Team in 2018/19 we continued to collectively own the Corporate Risk Register, we reviewed all corporate risks quarterly, and monitored progress against the action plan of significant governance issues.
- 18. The Chief Executive has emphasised the importance of achieving consistent standards of governance and control across all directorates, and has reinforced these expectations to be monitored and managed through the senior management assurance statement process as we enter 2019/20.

#### Audit Manager Statement

(Public Sector Internal Audit Standards (PSIAS) - 2450)

- 19. The PSIAS state that the 'Chief Audit Executive must deliver an annual internal audit opinion and report that can be used by the organisation to inform its governance statement.' This must be based upon an objective assessment of the framework of governance, risk management and control. It must also include an evaluation of the adequacy and effectiveness of controls in responding to risks within the governance, operations and information systems.
- 20. This opinion has been prepared by the Audit Manager, based on the provisions of the PSIAS. In preparing and forming this opinion, assurance has been taken from a number of sources, including:
  - Assurance Audit Assignments work undertaken through the risk-based annual audit plan, with delivery prioritised to maximise assurance and added value. The audit plan is responsive to risk and informed by audit information and existing assurances, information from Senior Management, and monitoring of Council activity, strategy, risks, and wider assurance sources.
  - Discussion with Senior Managers quarterly relationship manager meetings with Directors, Audit Manager attendance at Assurance Senior Management Team meetings, and regular meetings with the Corporate Director Resources (Section 151 Officer) and the Chief Executive.
  - Consultancy advice and guidance offered generally or on specific matters, including the design and development of new processes, such as Procure to Pay (P2P) and a wider process and control reviews, such as a Service Review for Social Services.

- *Risk & Governance* assurance reviews on the co-ordination of the Corporate Risk Register, the management disclosures which support the Annual Governance Statement, and wider governance reviews (including programmes and projects and financial / contract procedures).
- 21. Based on the programme of audit work undertaken to assess internal controls and reviews of governance and risk management arrangements, it is considered that the application of the overall framework for control within the Council for 2018/19 is *effective with opportunity for improvement*. This opinion is based on the delivery of a comprehensive audit plan, and an acknowledgment of the increasing pressure on resources in both demand and budgets, which has been managed through a resilient performance culture.
- 22. The control environment for core financial systems, and for the majority of audits overall (70%) was considered as adequate, and allocated an effective audit opinion. Twenty audits have been given an audit opinion of "insufficient with major improvement needed" recognising the need for attention to achieve sound controls, and six audits were given "unsatisfactory" opinions in certain Schools, School Traded Services, and areas of Waste Management. Allegations of fraud isolated within the Waste Management Service have been robustly investigated and are being managed in accordance with the Council's disciplinary policy, and through Police liaison. Audit assurance and support, targets and follows up on the highest risk areas.

#### Audit Committee Statement

23. Based on the evidence presented to the Audit Committee during 2018/19, it is the considered view of the Committee that the Council does have, for the most part, sound internal controls and governance arrangements in place. Strategic risks representing the true challenges facing the Council are well captured and reviewed on a regular basis. Examples of where the Committee continues to have concerns, which will be incorporated into the Committee's Work Programme for 2019/20, include:

Budget Management	The Audit Committee recognises the sustained financial pressure that the Council is under and notes that whilst the overall financial position was projected to be balanced, some particular directorates had projected significant overspends, for which controls have been in need of improvement.			
	The Audit Committee continues to raise concerns about the controls in place within directorates to achieve budget savings proposals put forward, which is increasingly important as the financial parameters within which the Council operate become further constrained. The Committee will be interested in the level of savings achieved in 2019/20 and will reinforce expectations for delivery given the significant financial pressures facing the Council.			

Internal Control	The continuing reduction in resources, together with a growing population and greater demand for public services, mean that the Council is facing significant challenges in how it delivers services. At a time when many decisions have to be finance driven, it is essential that internal controls are not neglected or impaired, and that strong controls operate throughout reformed processes and systems.
	The Audit Committee has invited senior officers to attend each Committee meeting this year, to account for their delivery of good governance, risk management and internal control. In addition, the Audit Committee has continued to receive the details of all Internal Audits completed, and the respective assurance ratings. We have observed isolated internal control gaps in areas of Waste Management, and within certain Schools and School Traded services. Whilst the number of unsatisfactory Internal Audit opinions remain low, management must maintain sound systems of internal control and promptly address identified weaknesses. The Audit Committee is aware of the allegations of fraud within the Waste Management Service, which have been investigated within the Council and referred to the Police. Once associated disciplinary procedures have concluded, Audit Committee will seek assurance on the robustness of post investigation review.
	The Committee receives a list of all Internal Audit recommendations raised and agreed, and visibility of updated management comments until the point of implementation. Whilst the Audit Committee has an overall assurance of internal control, we continue to require officers to account for services or functions where internal control weaknesses have been identified. We continue to challenge any impairment in stewardship and control of public funds and assets, seeking prompt and proportionate management actions. The Audit Committee has approved the 2019/20 Internal Audit Plan and will closely monitor its progress and findings over the year.
Financial Resilience (including Treasury Management)	In a position of austerity, the Audit Committee is focussed on ensuring that financial decisions are made for the benefit the organisation over the medium and long term, in addition to meeting current service needs. The Audit Committee has received updates on financial resilience as part of the finance updates and has welcomed the assurance to be gained from an ongoing external review of the Council Treasury Management activities, by the Council's Treasury Management advisors. The outputs of this review will inform our focus in 2019/20.
	The Audit Committee will continue to look to gain assurance of sound treasury management practices and strategy. This is vital work, which will both safeguard and deliver best value from the

	Council's borrowing and investments. The Audit Committee has and will continue to satisfy itself that the levels and profiles of investments and borrowing throughout the year are appropriate and in line with the Treasury Management Practices, Strategy and Reports presented.
Schools Governance & Compliance	Audit Committee has raised concerns about governance and compliance matters in schools for some time, which are regularly responsible for a greater proportion of audit reports giving concern. This year, whilst we have received comfort from the assurances given through school governance themed audit work, certain schools have not achieved a satisfactory level of stewardship and internal control.
	In view of an ongoing need for regular school governance assurance, Audit Committee has arranged to receive an update from the Director of Education and Lifelong Learning twice a year on the monitoring, controls and progress of governance improvements in Schools for which an assurance gap has been identified. This is with the understanding that Audit Committee can request the attendance of those directly responsible for governance at an individual school level, to a Committee meeting, in the event that assurances are not considered as acceptable.
	The Committee acknowledges that the Council is not able to set rules for schools to adhere to regarding contracting matters, albeit advice can be offered on good practice. This area of interest remains a priority of the Audit Committee. The Audit Committee continues to support the production and use of best practice guidance in schools to strengthen financial stewardship and control.

#### ii) Governance Framework - Supporting Information

### A. Behaving with integrity, demonstrating strong commitment to ethical values, and respecting the rule of law.

- 24. All Members and Officers in the Council are required to comply fully with Codes of Conduct as set out in the Constitution, which sets out the particular roles and responsibilities of Officers and Members and provides clarity on the interfaces between these roles. These include:
  - Functions and subsections delegated to Officers
  - Members' Code of Conduct
  - Employees' Code of Conduct
  - Protocol on Member / Officer Relations

- Cardiff Undertaking signed by all Members upon election and underlines their duties to the City and its citizens
- 25. The Director of Governance and Legal Services is the Monitoring Officer, has the specific duty to ensure that the Council, its Officers, and its Elected Councillors, maintain the highest standards of conduct in all they do based on Section 5 of the Local Government and Housing Act 1989, as amended by Schedule 5 paragraph 24 of the Local Government Act 2000.
- 26. The Standards and Ethics Committee has a responsibility to monitor and scrutinise the ethical standards of the Authority, its Members, employees and any associated providers of the Authority's services, and to report to the Council on any matters of concern. The Committee is chaired by an independent person and its role includes determining the outcome of complaints against Councillors and Co-opted Members and monitoring the Council's whistleblowing procedures.
- 27. In 2018/19 the Monitoring Officer was notified of a total of twelve complaints relating to Member conduct. The Monitoring Officer has not referred any of these complaints to the Public Services Ombudsman, however, six complaints were made directly by the complainants to the Ombudsman. Four of the complaints relate to one Member's activities in connection with a particular organisation. Two of these complaints were made directly to the Ombudsman. One these two matters the Ombudsman determined that it was not appropriate to investigate these complaints. The other two related complaints were resolved informally by the Monitoring Officer. One was resolved by way of an explanation, and the complainant agreed that no further action was necessary. The other complaint was resolved by the Member offering an immediate apology and repayment of Council printing costs. Of the remaining eight complaints, four have been resolved informally by the Monitoring Officer. One complaint was determined by the Ombudsman with a finding of no evidence of a breach of the Code. Another complaint determined by the Ombudsman related to 10 members of the Planning Committee which resulted in the decision by the Ombudsman not to investigate the complaint. Two complaints remain awaiting the decision of the Ombudsman.
- 28. In May 2017, Councillor Huw Thomas was elected as the new Leader of the Council and appointed a new Cabinet. In order to learn lessons from the experiences of those who had held the office of Councillor over the five year term, they were invited to complete a Member Exit Survey in February 2017. The summary of the survey was reported in the Annual Governance Statement for 2017/18.
- 29. The results from the Member Exit Survey in 2017 were discussed at the Annual Meeting between the Standards and Ethics Committee and the Political Group Leaders and Whips on 13 June 2018. The outcome of this was included in the Standards & Ethics Annual Report.
- 30. The key aspects from the survey were that there was an 'observed improvement in Members' conduct and the quality of debate at Council

meetings was welcomed, that the reduction in the number of formal complaints was very encouraging, and that Member conduct issues indicated some positive trends, but also identified some level of bullying and behavioural issues'.

- 31. The Standard and Ethics Committee in June 2018 received the analysis of responses relating to Member Conduct and behaviour and matters referred on to the all Party Women's Group to consider. The All Party Women's Council Group is a Member Group set up in accordance with Part 5 of the Constitution, administered by a lead Member and all Members are invited to participate. The Group established in 2017 did not meet during the 2018/19 Municipal Year due to the availability of the Chair.
- 32. The Standards and Ethics Committee introduced bi-annual Member briefings to report on the work of the Committee and to underline the importance of the Cardiff Undertaking. During 2018/19 one meeting of the Standards and Ethics Committee took place. The associated Member Briefing prepared to reflect outcomes of the meeting issued in February 2019.
- 33. The Member Exit Survey will be undertaken towards the end of an administrative period with the next Survey scheduled for March 2022.
- 34. Members and Co-opted Members are required to register their personal interests in any business of the authority, and to adhere to associated practices in accordance with the Member Code of Conduct. The disclosures are published on the Council's website within member profile information. An Officers' Personal Interests & Secondary Employment Policy requires staff to disclose any personal interest which actually or potentially conflicts with their duties to the Council and all secondary employment. The policy sets out how all Council employees are obliged, under the Employees' Code of Conduct, to ensure that their private interests do not conflict with their public duties, and to comply with the Council's rules on the registration and declaration of financial and non-financial interests. The procedures for managing officer's personal interests have been reviewed and agreed by Senior Management Team and the register will be published on the Council's website during 2019/20.
- 35. The Council's Corporate Values focus on fairness, openness and working together. The Council supports a culture of behaviour based on these values which guide how the long term vision of the Council is put into effect, as well as how Members and Officers deliver their day to day roles. Corporate and directorate planning and personal performance and development arrangements are aligned to delivering corporate values and priorities.
- 36. The Workforce Strategy and Employee Charter continues to ensure that there is alignment between the Council's vision and values and the Corporate Plan:

- The Employee Charter sets out the expectations of all staff (employees, managers and senior managers) and has formed part of the objective setting process for personal reviews
- The Workforce Strategy seeks to deliver outcomes for and with employees, within a culture that supports a flexible, skilled, engaged and diverse workforce
- 37. The Council takes fraud, corruption and maladministration very seriously supported by the following policies to prevent, and manage such occurrences:
  - Financial Procedure Rules
  - Contract Standing Order and Procurement Rules
  - Whistleblowing Policy
  - Fraud, Bribery and Corruption Policy
  - Money Laundering Policy and Procedure
  - ICT Security Policy
  - Data Protection Policy & Procedure
  - HR policies regarding investigation and discipline of staff
- 38. Induction training is undertaken by staff to ensure awareness and understanding on a range of policies, procedures and regulations including those relating to Financial Control, Data Protection, Health & Safety, Equalities and IT Security. Induction training also ensures that staff are aware of the corporate values and how they should be applied.
- 39. The Council has a Whistleblowing Policy in place through which staff and contractors are encouraged to speak out on misconduct or illegal behaviour within the organisation, which affects the public or other people (making a disclosure in the public interest). There have not been any new whistleblowing cases reported to the Monitoring Officer in 2018/19.
- 40. The Corporate Director Resources is the Council's Section 151 Officer with overall responsibility for the financial administration of the Council and is also the Senior Information Risk Owner (SIRO) with overall responsibility for the information governance arrangements of the Council. The Council's financial management arrangements conform to the governance requirements of the CIPFA Statement on the Role of the Chief Financial Officer in Local Government (2016) and the Information Governance requirements set out in the Data Protection Act 2018. During 2018/19 the recruitment of a new Corporate Director Resources commenced. The new post holder took up the position on the conclusion of the budget strategy and budget setting process in March 2019. Transition arrangements were put in place to the end of the financial year to ensure continuity.
- 41. During 2018/19 the post of a full time Audit Manager was re-established after a period of strategic oversight by the Head of Finance as the Acting Audit Manager.

#### B. Ensuring openness and comprehensive stakeholder engagement.

- 42. Through its Corporate Values, the Council outlines a commitment to being "open and honest about the difficult choices we face, and allowing people to have their say on what's important to them and their communities." Consultation, engagement and joint working with citizens are central to delivering this value and are outlined as follows.
- 43. To support openness, the Council is focusing on proactively publishing data through the Open Data Strategy as part of the Council's Publication Scheme. It has adopted the UK government's approach to publishing data to a minimum of 3 stars out of a 5 star scale. This means data should be easily accessible and available to re-use as required (subject to terms outlined in the Open Government Licence). Data sets continue to be identified for publication.
- 44. There is open debate and challenge on performance and risk management with quarterly reporting and review in Senior Management Team (SMT) and further challenge and oversight in Cabinet, Scrutiny and Audit Committee meetings. A Risk Management Steering Group is in place to develop and review risk management policy and accountability frameworks and to support SMT in identifying new and emerging corporate risks. An Assurance Board has been developed within the SMT environment where the Chief Executive, and Directors discuss aspects of the assurance, for example risk management, performance management, outcomes and progress on audit recommendations made by the internal and external bodies and regulators. This has increased the visibility and the connections between these assurance pieces. The meetings between the Chief Executive, Directors and Cabinet Members to agree actions arising from an open debate of performance and service delivery challenges has continued in 2018/19.
- 45. Meetings of the Council, Cabinet and Committees are generally open to the public to attend except where confidential or exempt information is being discussed, as defined by the law. Full Council meetings include a facility for public questions, and the Council's Scrutiny Committees invite stakeholder contributions to their scrutiny programme, both through research and consultation exercises and through direct access to Committees. During 2018/19 Council meetings and the Planning Committee meeting were the primary focus of webcasts. Scrutiny and other meetings were allocated webcasting time based on public interest and prioritisation of specific items including the development and implementation of dual language webcast for Council meetings. A review of webcasting to identify and widen and balance webcasting use with other committees and meetings is planned to establish future webcasting priorities. Papers and reports are also available on the Council's website to assist with engagement in webcasting, and in general.
- 46. The public and other stakeholders are given the opportunity to tell the Council what they think about the services provided through the Council's Comments, Complaints and Compliments Policy. It reflects guidance given in the Welsh Government Model Policy and Guidance Paper for Handling Complaints, as well as guidance received from the Public Service Ombudsman for Wales and

places a greater emphasis on a prompt resolution of complaints. Cabinet is informed annually of the number of complaints received.

- 47. Citizens, communities and partners continue to be engaged through a programme of citizen engagement, budget consultation, Ask Cardiff surveys that seek opinions of a range of Quality of Life and Quality of Services statements. The output of these are used to inform proposals and decisions of priorities and planning for the provision of services.
- 48. Regular meetings are held with institutional stakeholders to whom the Council is accountable, which include the Welsh Government and the Council's External Auditors (Wales Audit Office). Efforts have also been made to foster open and effective relationships between the County Council and the six Community Councils in Cardiff through a Community Councils Charter ("the Charter"). It reflects the model Charter issued by the Welsh Government in the Local Government (Wales) Measure 2011 and is based on equality of partnership between the two tiers of local government.
- 49. The Cardiff Public Services Board (PSB) represents a statutory partnership of public and voluntary sector organisations, chaired by the Leader of the Council to deliver the requirements of the Wellbeing of Future Generations Act 2015. The Wellbeing Plan which responds to the evidence from the Wellbeing Assessment and focusses on the areas of public service delivery which fundamentally require partnership working between public and community services, and the citizens of Cardiff was adopted by Full Council and statutory member organisations by the statutory deadline of May 3rd 2018. During 2018/19 the relationships have matured and a Leadership Group comprised of elected members, and a Delivery Group comprised of the Chief Executives established where the delivery of the Wellbeing Plan is monitored through a process of high level exception reporting.
- 50. The Council regularly engages in consultation with the Trade Unions and a 'Partnership for Change Agreement' was signed off in February 2015. This supports the Council's Leader, Cabinet and Trade Unions in working together to reform Council services in a cost effective manner, providing a level of certainty for staff on major issues and protecting jobs wherever possible.

### C. Defining outcomes in terms of sustainable economic, social, and environmental benefits.

- 51. The Capital Ambition sets out how a series of principles will underpin the development of the Council in the coming years, namely: getting the basics right, digital first, putting communities front and centre, joining-up of frontline services, purposeful partnerships and a new deal for citizens. The four priorities are:
  - Working for Cardiff: Making sure that all our citizens can contribute to, and benefit from, the city's success
  - Working for Wales: A successful Wales needs a successful capital city
  - Working for the Future: Managing the city's growth in a sustainable way

- Working for Public Services: Making sure our public services are delivered efficiently, effectively and sustainably in the face of rising demand and reducing budgets.
- 52. The Corporate Plan is aligned to the focus of the political vision set out in the Capital Ambition and sets out the organisation's priorities and clear improvement objectives to be delivered with the support of Lead Members. In order to provide a more consistent approach to planning across a range of partners there are clear links between the Partnership Plan, and the regional plan with the Health Board as a result of the Social Services and Wellbeing (Wales) Act 2014 The Corporate Plan is a rolling 3 year plan which is refreshed annually. The latest refresh was approved by Council in February 2019 for the period 2019 2022, informed by the consultation on budget proposals for 2019/20. It sets the strategic direction and provides a framework for Directorate Plan priorities are based on the same Wellbeing Objectives as the Cardiff PSB:
  - Cardiff is a great place to grow up
  - Cardiff is a great place to grow older
  - Supporting people out of poverty
  - Safe, confident and empowered communities
  - A capital city that works for Wales
  - Cardiff grows in a resilient way
  - Modernising and integrating our public services
- 53. The delivery of the Corporate Plan is monitored through the Council's Performance Management Framework, which includes:
  - Quarterly Performance monitoring by SMT as part of it's Assurance Board role
  - Progress reported to Members alongside the Budget Monitoring
  - Joint Cabinet and Senior Management Team Performance Challenge meetings
  - Quarterly monitoring of the strategic issues arising from delivering the Capital Ambition is undertaken at a joint Cabinet and Senior Management meeting
- 54. The four year Capital Ambition Delivery Programme replaced the Council's Organisational Development Programme (ODP) in 2017/18, is aligned to the delivery of corporate priorities and budgets, and comprises of two discrete components:
  - Modernisation: Transformation of corporate systems and processes that support service delivery, led by the Corporate Director Resources
  - Resilient Services: Transformation of front-line services, led by the Corporate Director People and Communities
- 55. The Council has committed to the Sustainable Development Charter and making decisions that produce the best long-term outcomes for Cardiff and the future of Wales. The Council participates in the CCR City Deal, which aims to enhance development, infrastructure, land use, economic development and

employment. The CCRCD involves the UK Government, Welsh Government and ten Council's working together, through joint enterprise.

- 56. The CCR City Deal five year strategic business plan was approved by the Regional Cabinet of 10 local authority leaders in February 2018 and the governance arrangements have been strengthened to include a Joint Scrutiny Committee which is hosted by Bridgend County Borough Council on behalf of the local authority partners.
- 57. During 2018/19 the Wales Audit Office reviewed the governance arrangements put in place to support the CCR City Deal's first investment decision. They identified that as the decision was made very early in the newly formed partnership and before the agreed assurance framework was fully in place, that there are lessons to be learnt for future investment decisions by the CCR City Deal and other similar partnerships.
- 58. The Final Local Government Settlement for 2018/19 for Cardiff was received in December 2017 equated to a funding increase of 0.9%. Additional cash of £3.98 million was allocated compared with 2017/18, but this was eroded to £2.426 million (+0.55%) once new responsibilities and other differentiating year on year factors were taken into account. The Council has continued to focus on using the resources available to deliver corporate priorities within a balanced budget.
- 59. Consultation on the Council's 2018/19 budget proposals "Changes for Cardiff" ran from 2nd November 2017 14th December 2017. As outlined under principle B. Ensuring openness and comprehensive engagement of this AGS, a number of mechanisms were used to ensure the consultation was as accessible as possible. The consultation enabled members of the public to communicate their views on the budget proposals. It informed the final decisions on service changes, which focussed on delivering valued public services in the face of ongoing austerity.
- 60. Building on the approach to the Council's Budget Strategy over the last few years is key to planning for future years. The Council has identified a budget gap of £73 million for the period 2019/20 to 2021/22. The outlook over the medium term remains a matter of concern and the Budget Report 2019/20 details the challenges in respect of ongoing financial austerity, increasing financial pressures and the difficulty offsetting and realising year on year budget savings. A deliverable Budget Strategy has been a key document for meeting the radical changes which must continue to be made to the shape of the organisation in order for it to remain operational and resilient.

### D. Determining the interventions necessary to optimise the achievement of the intended outcomes.

61. Cardiff City Transport Services Ltd. (Cardiff Bus), one of the Council's wholly owned subsidiary companies, reviewed the composition of the Board and agreed a revised structure in November 2018. Appointments to the Board were concluded by the end of the financial year.

- 62. To ensure decision makers are well informed, all decisions taken by Members are supported by written reports from Officers on the legal, HR and financial implications arising from the decision. These reports are also required to outline the economic, social and environmental outcomes, the key risks and alternative courses of action which are available.
- 63. To support delivery of the requirements of the Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015, the Council has developed well-being objectives and a wellbeing statement as part of the development of the Corporate Plan. This process has helped to integrate the sustainable development principle and the Act in organisational processes and decision making. The 5 ways of working have been integrated into our partnership planning to ensure a more systemic approach to delivering the identified outcomes.
- 64. The Corporate Plan continues to be informed by the views of the views of a range of stakeholders, including the people of Cardiff, public service and private sector partners, and Council staff helped contribute to the development of the Council's well-being objectives. This includes:
  - The Ask Cardiff annual resident survey, gives people the opportunity to tell the Council about their own well-being and their experiences of public services, and helps the Council understand what is important to residents and local communities. With over 5,500 responses it is one of the most successful surveys of this type in Wales or across UK Core Cities.
  - Consultation with seldom heard groups such as locality and partner events in neighbourhood areas, the Cardiff Youth Council Grand Council, the 50 + Forum focus group, BAME focus groups, Cardiff Deaf Club, Cardiff and Vale Action for Mental Health, Friends and Neighbours Group (Butetown)
  - An engagement event with the city's civic leadership at the 'Liveable City Forum'
- 65. To ensure staff are consulted, and involved in decision making, various channels of communication are used including Corporate Roadshows, the Chief Executive's Update, Core Brief, Staff Information messages, the Staff App, and DigiGov (the Council's HR system). The staff Ambassador Group remains active and met with Directors during 2018/19 which has also seen a period of reflection with regards to employee engagement. A revised Employee Engagement Strategy will be brought forward in the new financial year which will also include a rebranding of the Ambassador group and their terms of reference.
- 66. Consultation on draft decisions resulting from budget proposals is robust and the impact on citizens and service users is an important consideration. The engagement of citizens has continued to be an important means of identifying and designing services to meet the needs and expectations of service users and citizens in Cardiff in the context of budgetary constraints. To support robust project based decision making, the Council has developed a Business Case

template using the Office of Government Commerce (OGC) "Five Case Model", as recommended by HM Treasury for use by Public Sector bodies.

- 67. The Council has a performance management framework to facilitate and measure the delivery of priorities at City, Council, Directorate and officer levels. The framework includes statutory National Strategic Indicators (NSI) together with locally selected measures of success which are relevant to Cardiff. The annual performance against these indicators is submitted to the Welsh Government to be audited as part of the revised Wales Programme for Improvement as a result of the Local Government (Wales) Measure. This framework ensures that there is alignment between Performance against the Council's targets, and that objectives are reported publicly on a quarterly and annual basis.
- 68. The Council's Budget Strategy is based on an incremental budgeting approach where budgets are informed to a greater extent by corporate priorities and the required future shape of the organisation.
- 69. The themes for savings in the Budget Strategy for 2019/20 were aligned with general budgetary questions that formed part of the Ask Cardiff consultation, in synergy with the Council's corporate plan priorities, as follows:
  - Income generation
  - Working with Partners and others
  - Use of technology
  - Review of subsidies and grants
  - Internally facing proposals
  - Second /.third year of proposals
  - Service reduction / redesign
- 70. To provide greater confidence in the delivery of savings directorate proposals once submitted were subject to challenge to ensure clarity in ownership, accuracy, feasibility, achievability and risk management. These arrangements were replicated for the development of the Budget Strategy for 2019/20 during the planning period August 2018 to February 2019.
- 71. The Wales Audit Office (WAO) audit under the Public Audit (Wales) Act 2004 and reporting responsibilities under the Code of Audit Practice found that

'The Council has appropriate arrangements in place to secure economy, efficiency and effectiveness in its use of resources.'

*'work on certification of grant claims and returns has not identified significant issues that would impact on the financial statements or key financial systems'.* 

72. The Council's risk management guidance emphasises the requirement to incorporate risk management into all levels of business, including the management of shared risks through programme, project and partnership arrangements.

### E. Developing the entity's capacity, including the capability of its leadership and the individuals within it.

- 73. The Annual Wellbeing Statement (formerly the Annual Improvement Plan) provides a comprehensive statement of progress and areas of challenge and links to the Corporate Planning arrangements.
- 74. Decision making responsibilities and authority are clearly set out in the Council's Constitution. It documents the roles and relationships for decision making, between the Full Council, the Cabinet, Scrutiny and other Non-Executive Committees. It also details decisions delegated to senior officers through the different management tiers.
- 75. The Cabinet is the part of the Council which is responsible for most major decisions. The Cabinet is made up of the Leader elected by the Council, and up to nine other councillors whom he/she nominates for approval by the Council. The Cabinet has to make decisions which are in line with the Council's overall policies and budget. If it wishes to make a decision which is outside the budget or policy framework, this must be referred to the Council as a whole to decide.
- 76. The Council's programme of strategic business change has been aligned with the priorities of the new administration through the four year Capital Ambition Delivery Programme, which uses a best practice governance approach (Project Quality Assurance (PQA)) to provide effective planning, monitoring and delivery. Governance arrangements are in place for the Capital Ambition Delivery Programme, which include regular updates to the Senior Management Team.
- 77. The senior management structure of the Council was reviewed in 2017/18 to align with and support the delivery of the Capital Ambition. The Chief Executive (Head of Paid Service) is the most senior member of the Council's staff and has responsibility for overall management supported by a number of Directors and Assistant Director / Chief Officer posts. This revised senior management structure was put in place during 2018/19.

New Posts	Deleted Posts
Corporate Director, People and	Director of Communities, Housing and
Communities	Customer Services
Director Planning, Transport and	Director, City Operations
Environment (previously Director,	
City Operations)	
Chief Digital Officer	Assistant Director, Children's Services
Assistant Director, Corporate	Assistant Director, Commercial Services
Landlord	
Assistant Director, Street Scene	Enterprise Architecture Operational
	Manager
Head of Democratic Services	

- 78. The Council aims to ensure that Members and Officers have the skills, knowledge and capacity to discharge their responsibilities effectively and recognises the importance of well trained, competent people. New staff and Members attend an induction programme to introduce them to the Council and its values, objectives, policies and procedures. An in-house Cardiff Manager Programme represents a commitment to increasing the learning and development of staff with line management responsibilities. The programme is well embedded, and a review undertaken during 207/18 has led to offering this programme more widely across the officer body without the requirement to sit a formal ILM level 3 qualification.
- 79. A Member Learning and Development Programme aims to provide Members with access to a range of development opportunities to assist them in delivering their roles as Community Leaders and Council representatives. The programme is informed by the WLGA Continuing Professional Development for Councillors Competency Framework, which sets out the range of skills and knowledge required by Members. During 2018/19 the Democratic Services Committee led on the development of an Elected Member Learning and Development Strategy. This Strategy identifies key elements to support the governance arrangements of the Authority including a review of role descriptions which will clarify the individual role of member in the decision making process, and the introduction of a Personal Review Process to support the provision of appropriate learning opportunities to improve the skills and knowledge of elected Members.
- 80. Performance is primarily evaluated through the Council's Personal Review process, which provides a framework for employees and managers to discuss work performance and behaviour as well as to identify learning and development needs. It enables employees to be clear about their roles, responsibilities and the behaviours expected of them whilst giving a clear understanding of how their job and efforts contribute to the Council's objectives. Member Personal Reviews are also in place to help them update their knowledge and learn new skills, where required, to be more effective in supporting their communities. The Cardiff Council Academy provides a number of learning and development programmes and courses.
- 81. The Council's Workforce Strategy has employee health and wellbeing as a priority. The Council continues to support the 'Time to Change' Pledge, has been recognised as a Disability Confident Employer, signed the Dying to Work Charter and achieved the Corporate Health Standard Silver Award. During 2018/19 the Council has continued to work towards being recognised as a Dementia Friendly organisation and achieving the Corporate Health Standard Gold Award by March 2020. The Council continued during 2018/19 to deliver the Employee Health and Wellbeing Strategy 2016-19 which provides a broad framework to address barriers to wellbeing and identify ways to improve employee wellbeing.
- 82. During 2018/19 the Council has published an Annual Wellbeing Report (formerly the Statutory Improvement Report) which provides a retrospective

summary evaluation of performance for 2017/18 as required by the Local Government (Wales) Measure 2009.

- 83. In assessing progress against Improvement Objectives, a number of sources of information were used including reviews of inspection reports, surveys, feedback, case studies and performance measures. Performance improved against 79% of its indicators, performance was maintained against 7.1% of its indicators and performance declined against 14.3% which represents 2 indicators. This saw the Council's ranking rise significantly within the local government family comparative performance to 5th as compared to 13th in 2016/17.
- 84. The Wales Audit Office published their Annual Improvement Report 2017/18 of the Council in September 2018. This is a forward-looking assessment that considers the likelihood of compliance with the Council's duty to make arrangements to secure continuous improvement, as well as a view on how the Council was working towards the requirements and obligations in relation to the Wellbeing of Future Generations Act, a service-user-perspective themed review and a review of overview and scrutiny arrangements.
- 85. The report did not raise any formal recommendations, but it made proposals for improvement relating to potential development, transparency, and the role of Scrutiny can have in governance when determining service changes. The report concluded that:

'The Council is meeting its statutory requirements in relation to continuous improvement based on, and limited to, the work carried out by the Wales Audit Office and relevant regulators, the Auditor General believes that the Council is likely to comply with the requirements of the Local Government Measure (2009) during 2018-19'

### F. Managing risks and performance through robust internal control and strong public financial management.

- 86. Risk management is an integral part of strategic decision making, forming a key element of business planning, budget proposals, budget strategy, programme and project considerations. A Corporate Risk Register (CRR) is maintained and reviewed by SMT each quarter to ensure it includes key risks to the corporate vision, objectives and priorities. A Corporate Risk Map has also been used throughout 2018/19 to provide a transparent representation of the status of corporate risks and to support a proportionate management response.
- 87. The revised Risk Management Strategy and Policy, which had been developed by the risk management network, with comments from the Cabinet, and considered by the Audit Committee in January 2018 was approved for operation from the second financial quarter of 2018/19.
- 88. The responsibility for the day to day management of the risk management process moved from the Information Governance and Risk Management Team to the Accountancy Team in December 2018. The process has continued to

be supported by a nominated Member Risk Champion, Senior Officer Risk Champion and a network of Directorate Risk Champions. This process is designed to ensure clear ownership of risks which are identified, reviewed and escalated systematically each financial quarter.

- 89. Decisions are made based on reports from Officers which include assessments of the legal, HR and financial implications arising from the decision. Service delivery is monitored through risk registers and performance information and reports. The Annual Wellbeing Report (formerly the Statutory Improvement Report) provides an annual summary of performance against Welsh Government indicators and corporate priorities and commitments. Projects and Programmes are monitored using PQA criteria, including use of milestones, risk and issue registers and lessons learned methodologies.
- 90. The Council's five standing Scrutiny Committees are designed to support the Cabinet in providing accessible, efficient and effective services for citizens. They meet on a monthly basis to undertake pre-decision scrutiny, policy monitoring and review and launch in-depth inquiries to help the Cabinet develop and review policies and services. The majority of recommendations raised to Cabinet following Scrutiny Inquiries are fully accepted. A number of the Council's collaborative activities are governed by Joint Committees. Examples include the CCR City Deal Joint (Regional) Cabinet and a Joint (Regional) Scrutiny Committee, Wales Pension Partnership Joint Governance Committee, Prosiect Gwyrdd Joint Committee, the Shared Regulatory Services Joint Committee and the Glamorgan Archives Joint Committee.
- 91. The Audit Committee provides assurance to the Council on the effectiveness of its governance, risk management, and internal control arrangements through a wide ranging programme of work. The Audit Committee through its work programme has standard agenda items at each meeting which include; budgetary and financial information, treasury management, risk and governance, internal audit, external audit and operational matters. The Audit Manager reports functionally to the Audit Committee and administratively to the Council's Deputy Section 151 Officer.
- 92. The Internal Audit Team assesses governance as part of the majority of audit engagements and the overall review of governance, risk management and control has informed the annual assurance statement from the Audit Manager. All recommendations issued by Internal Audit are reported to the Audit Committee and tracked to provide assurance that they are acted upon.
- 93. Performance is monitored regularly within directorates on an ongoing basis. Members and senior managers are provided with quarterly performance information on a balanced scorecard basis, with performance measured against performance indicators aligned to corporate plan priorities. The standard corporate risk scoring approach is used to measure performance and enable consistency of understanding. The financial element of the balanced scorecard quantifies variances between the budget and actual position for each Directorate in respect of the overall budget position, savings delivery and staff costs.

- 94. The Council has robust arrangements for internal control. The risk management strategy and policy enables consistency in risk assessments across the Council, supported by a portfolio of policies and procedures to ensure effective stewardship of public monies, address maladministration, corruption and fraud, as summarised under Principal B 'behaving with integrity, demonstrating strong commitment to ethical values, and respecting the rule of law'.
- 95. Effective arrangements are in place to safeguard personal data. During 2018/19, the Council continued to prepare for, and enacted the General Data Protection Regulation and Data Protection Act 2018 on 25th May 2018. An action plan setting out the changes in legislation provided the focus of the work from aligning policies and processes through to raising awareness. The Corporate Director Resources is the Council's Senior Information Risk Owner, supported by a dedicated team who manage the overall Council approach to information management. An Information Governance Strategy contains a suite of information governance policies, procedures and guidance information to support compliance with the Freedom of Information Act / Environmental Information Regulations, Data Protection Act, Privacy and Electronic Communication Regulations and Protection of Freedoms Act. The Council's approach to aspects of Information Governance was tested during 2018/19 through a number of internal audits and an external assessment against the national Cyber Essentials + Standard where no issues were raised.
- 96. An Information Governance Training Strategy sits alongside the Information Governance Strategy to enable clear understanding of corporate and individual responsibilities. A risk assessment determines the extent of staff training, information and support required to provide the Council and the Information Commissioner's Office with the required assurance. Members are registered with the Information Commissioner's Office as individual Data Controllers.
- 97. The Council has a Health and Safety Forum, comprised of appointed Elected Members, Union Representatives and relevant Council Officers, which met quarterly during 2018/19 to review, provide feedback and approve a number of health and safety related policy and guidance documents.
- 98. The Forum, in line with their Terms of Reference, also monitored statutory maintenance compliance (focussing on high risk disciplines), Legionella Management, Fire Safety (the changes affecting the Council's Social Housing Development arising from the 'Building a Safer Future' report), the new health and safety support service to schools (introduced September 2018), and continued to review RIDDOR reportable accident/incidents.
- 99. As outlined in the section on Principle D 'Determining the interventions necessary to optimise the achievement of the intended outcomes' significant attention has been given to financial management to support both long term and operational performance, through medium term financial planning and robust financial resilience mechanisms. This is integrated into all levels of planning and control, and is tracked both through performance monitoring of outcomes and through the corporate risk management mechanisms.

### G. Implementing good practices in transparency, reporting, and audit to deliver effective accountability.

- 100. The Council aims for all reports for the public and other stakeholders to be written in a fair, balanced and understandable way. This is to achieve a balance between providing full and complete information to demonstrate clear transparency without being onerous or overly complex.
- 101. The Council also aims for information to be easy for the Council and the public to find and use. It has adopted the Information Commissioner's model publication scheme, which sets out the classes of information that should be routinely available.
- 102. The Council's Annual Wellbeing Report (formerly the Statutory Improvement Report) evaluates performance, summarising the findings of a number of reports on performance, including corporate measures and evaluations of delivery against the Capital Ambition, Wellbeing Plan and the objectives and activities that the Council is delivering as part of the Partnership arrangements (PSB).
- 103. The AGS is an assessment of the governance of the Council applied to the 'Delivering Good Governance in Local Government' CIPFA / SOLACE framework, as outlined in the Assessment Process and Summary.
- 104. To demonstrate accountability, Senior Management Assurance Statements (SMAS) are completed by each Director twice a year to self-assess performance against a set of governance, risk management and internal control statements. The overall position is reviewed and authorised by the Chief Executive following the financial year end, at which point the overall Senior Management Statement is included within section 4) Assessment Process and Summary. Collectively, SMT hold an action plan of significant governance issues, representing an open disclosure of the most prominent issues of governance which require attention following the SMAS review. The AGS Action Plan is included in the following section.
- 105. The SMAS, and AGS Action plan of significant governance issues are reviewed biannually by SMT, Audit Committee and the Risk Management Team. The aim is to achieve openness and transparency in Council affairs and identification, communication and management of matters which require corporate attention.
- 106. Council meet in May of each year to establish Committees: their size, terms of reference and allocation of seats. The Council's Constitution sets out the terms of reference for each of its Committees and the decisions that can be taken by each of those Committees, and is reviewed regularly by the Constitution Committee. A number of Committees have been appointed by Council to discharge regulatory and scrutiny services and they deliver annual reports on their performance and findings.

- 107. Prior to services being delivered through third parties or via joint working arrangements, the Legal Services Team assist directorates to ensure responsibilities and accountabilities for governance and risk management are adequately documented. The risk management policy strategy and methodology requires clear risk management arrangements in whichever model of service delivery is used.
- 108. Performance information is published against statutory NSI and PAM datasets, as set by the Welsh Government. This report includes ranking information to clearly, and transparently show performance relative to each other Local Authorities in Wales.
- 109. The Council has taken steps to ensure that recommendations for corrective action made by external audit are acted upon, and targeted governance projects are created to deliver the required improvements. Opportunities to learn from wider studies from the WAO are taken through the use of a tracker system to identify and summarise a range of their publications for the information and consideration of the Audit Committee.
- 110. The Council has an effective Internal Audit Service, as supported by performance information and reporting, which was externally assessed as conforming with the Public Sector Internal Audit Standards (PSIAS) in all material respects during 2017/18 by Rhondda Cynon Taf CBC. The PSIAS is a central measure of the effectiveness of the Internal Audit function against the mandatory elements of the International Professional Practices Framework. The small number of recommendations arising from the external assessment to enhance information in the Internal Audit Charter have continued to be progressed by the Audit Manager during 2018/19.
- 111. Peer challenges, reviews, and inspections from regulatory bodies are welcomed by Cardiff Council as a means to provide assurance over service delivery, or identify opportunities for improvement.

#### iii) AGS Action Plan – Significant Governance Issues

112. The following issues and actions were identified through the Senior Management Assurance process:

#### 'Informed, evidenced based decision making' including aspects of Future Generations and further assurance work in relation to partnership and collaborative governance

Actions:

- Review the decision making processes to ensure that all aspects connected with legal and regulatory compliance are embedded into the processes to support the management of risk
- Further strengthen and develop compliance information provided through the Assurance SMT as part of the decision making process and identify where improvements are needed as appropriate

- Implement the Partnership and Collaborative Governance Framework to improve the assurance around the governance of these models of service delivery
- Embed a consistent understanding and application of the Future Generations principle and five ways of working in its endeavours to improve outcomes for its citizens

## Compliance, specifically around understanding the gaps in the compliance (conformance) with the corporate process to provide a more focussed assessment

Actions:

- Review the compliance framework to ensure that all aspects are reflected in the 'Compliance Category' of the Senior Management Assurance Statement
- Implement the process of triangulation of Assurance Statements in line with the Council's Code of Corporate Governance and provide feedback through the Relationship Management Process to ensure that all aspects of compliance are representative

#### Significant Issues – The Cardiff and Vale of Glamorgan Pension Fund.

- 113. During 2018/19 the Wales Pension Partnership (WPP) obtained FCA approval for the Authorised Contractual Scheme (ACS) which enables the eight LGPS administering authorities in Wales to pool their investments in compliance with the requirements of the UK Government. The ACS is operated by Link Fund Solutions. Oversight by the eight authorities is through the Joint Governance Committee (JGC) comprising one elected member from each authority. The JGC is supported by an Officer Working Group (OWG) made up of the funds Treasurers and Investment Officers.
- 114. The first two sub funds within the ACS were launched in January 2019 with pooled assets of £4 billion. No assets were transferred from the Cardiff & Vale of Glamorgan Pension Fund during 2018/19 as the Global Equities asset class covered by the sub funds was outside the Pension Fund's current strategic asset allocation.
- 115. It is considered the following may have potential implications on future financial periods and are worthy of note in this statement.

Significant Issue	Year End Position 2018/19	Responsible Officer
Wales Pension Partnership – Wales Investment Pool. Further pooled funds will be	The Cardiff and Vale of Glamorgan Pension Fund to continue to participate in the development of investment pooling arrangements through the Joint Governance	Corporate
created during 2019/20.	Committee and the Officer Working Group.	Director Resources
Proposals for each fund will be approved by the JGC prior to submission to the FCA.	Developments are reported regularly to the Pensions Committee, the Investment Advisory Panel and the Local Pension Board	

#### Certification by the Leader of the Council and the Chief Executive

Councillor Huw Thomas, Leader of Cardiff Council Date:

Paul Orders, Chief Executive Date: